

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Architectural Review Committee
Meeting Minutes

Date: January 16, 2017

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8th Floor Homeland Security Conference Room, New Orleans, LA, 70112.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Adjourned: 4:00 p.m.

Members present: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members absent:

I. AGENDA

1. Approval of the minutes of the December 19, 2017 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Elliott Perkins

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 2627 Tchoupitoulas Ave.

Application: John Lambertson, applicant; Tchoup Party Stop LLC, owner; Demolition of three(3) existing one-story warehouse buildings and new construction of five-story, self-storage facility.

Speakers: Bill Sqwicki spoke against the application. Roy Carubba spoke in favor of the application.

Motion: John Klingman made the motion to to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that the proposal needed further study and as proposed is not appropriate for the district. The applicant should continue to study the site planning, articulation of the massing and fenestration to better relate to the neighboring warehouse buildings on the Tchoupitoulas corridor.

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 2223 Carondelet St.

Application: Looney Ricks Kiss/LRK LLC, applicant; 2223 Carondelet LLC, owner; New construction of two (2) single-family townhouses on a vacant lot.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- Galleries should be added to the front elevation of both structures.
- All transoms above windows should be removed.
- Windows should be changed from 9/9 to a more typical pattern with less lights.
- The full-length windows on the side elevations should be changed to a standard window size (ex. 3'-0 x 6'-0).
- The shutter on the front elevation should be removed.
- The gas lights should be smaller.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

4. 1521 S Carrollton St.

Application: Keith A Scarmuzza, applicant; Keith A Scarnuzza, owner; Removal and reconstruction of an addition and porch on the rear of the house

Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- The back porch columns should resemble those on page E2, but should be slightly larger

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

5. 3000 St. Claude Ave.

Application: EDR Architects, applicant; 3000-3032 St Claude Ave LLC, 3000-3032 St Claude Ave LLC, owner; Renovation of five existing buildings into a hotel, including the new construction of a building on the site. This project includes five parcels: municipal address 3000, 3014, 3020-22, 3024-26, and 3030-32 St. Claude Avenue.

Speakers: Danielle Maggio, Bettina Reutter, Miguel Montarell, Eve Abrams, Kourtney Keller, Jami A Henbery, Carolyn Leftwich, and Michael Bolan spoke against the application.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to defer a recommendation for conceptual approval. The ARC agreed that the proposal does not appear to have adequately developed the submission to show the proposed condition of the main entry from St. Claude Avenue. The next submission should include a more accurate/developed design of this location including lighting, signage, materials, landscaping, etc. Additionally, the proposed new building which fronts on St. Claude still lacks a presence. Further develop this building; potentially mirror the plan such that the porch is on the side closest to the Montegut St corner. It was also requested that a site visit be scheduled with the HDLC staff to better understand and verify visibility of the proposed new construction buildings from all locations of the surrounding public right-of-way.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

6. 2851 Chippewa St.
Application: Pearce Grieshaber, applicant; Carl J Mastio, owner; Renovate and construct 500 SF camelback addition to existing one-story, residential building.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the floor to ceiling height should come up to 10'-0" at the second floor addition, and windows should be no smaller than 3'x5'.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:

7. 1376 Camp St.
Application: James Brown, applicant; Coliseum Place Baptist Church, owner; New construction of two-story, single-family, residential building.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The overall building height and relationship to the neighboring structures needs to be studied.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:

8. 1127-31 Terpsichore St.
Application: James Brown, applicant; Coliseum Place Baptist Church, owner; New construction of two-story, single-family, residential building.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The entrance at the side and depth of the covered porch needs to be studied.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:

9. 3210 N Rampart St.
Application: Lesley Poche, applicant; 600 S Alexander St LLC, owner; New Construction of a two-story, single family 1,800 SF residential building with off street parking.
Motion: John Klingman made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that a design meeting should be scheduled between the applicant, design team, and the HDLC staff to go through the project and address design changes which should be incorporated prior to the next ARC Meeting. The ARC's recommendations included altering the proportions of the 2nd floor porch as the current proposal is too tall and not deep enough to be useable. The header heights of the windows and doors also appear to be too low. Also, the column at the carport is not an appropriate condition and other options should be explored, including possibly extending the end wall out towards the street. The detailing of the stoop needs more development and should be designed as a separate building element. The CMU chain wall should terminate at the building wall of the stoop. The orientation of the entry is not a typical residential condition and should be reconfigured so that it is read towards the street.
Second: Elliott Perkins
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:
10. 437 First St.
Application: Corey Newell, applicant; Sandra R Armelin, owner; New construction of two-story, single-family residential building.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that enclosing the ground floor porch was not appropriate, you should study the spacing of the slats to create an opening or a gradient to have more visibility at the lower level. The slats should wrap the corner or be integrated in the overhang condition. The windows may need to be wider, but you should study the condition.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:
11. 1212 Louisa St.
Application: Samuel Bavidio, applicant; Our Dreamlands LLC, owner; Demolition and extension of a rear addition and renovation of existing building with addition of two street facing dormers.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the segmental arch windows, transoms and dormer windows should be removed from the project and a simple rectangular opening should replace them. The walk through windows on the front porch are not appropriate and simple 6/6 double hung windows should be installed with consistent header heights throughout. Further, as this is a 4-bay building, the porch should be reconfigured to include 5 columns centered equally on the 4 existing bays and the front steps should be shifted to one side (centered on whichever door is to be the main entry). Finally, the dormers are conceptually appropriate but the detailing should be refined to reflect a historic condition.
Second: Robbie Cangelosi
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:

12. 2831 St. Claude Ave.

Application: Christopher Reade, applicant; Preservation Alliance Of N O Inc, owner; Construct rear deck on existing two-story commercial building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC recommended changing the handrails to a solid horizontal board configuration that should continue down the stairs. The ARC suggested using 2"x8" boards with a 1-1/2" gap.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

13. 951 St Mary St.

Application: Ronald Francis Jouandot, applicant; Jouandot Enterprises LLC, owner; Demolition of existing structure, and new construction of two story residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the design had improved, but the following items still need to be revised:

- The scale of the front door needs to be reduced.
- The configuration of the second floor door should be similar to windows or simplified.
- Box beam should be added to the first and second floor over hang conditions.
- Columns should be rectangular, wider side facing the street.
- Windows are too close to the edge of the building.
- Windows should be added toward the front of the building.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

14. 953 St Mary St.

Application: Ronald Francis Jouandot, applicant; Jouandot Enterprises LLC, owner; Demolition of existing structure and new construction of two story, single family residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the design had improved, but the following items still need to be revised:

- The scale of the front door needs to be reduced, and paired doors at the second floor porch are not appropriate.
- Box beam should be added to the first and second floor over hang conditions.
- Columns should be rectangular, wider side facing the street.
- Windows should be added toward the front of the building, a vertical stair window would be appropriate at the left side elevation.
- Proposed windows are too close to the edge of the building.
- Window types and sizes should be more consistent.
- Please make sure all drawings are accurate.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

15. 527 First St.

Comments: This item was withdrawn

16. 1130 Thalia St.

Application: Ingrid M Patin, applicant/owner; Enclose portion of the first & second floor porch at the front elevation.

Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that the proposal was not integrated to the design of the building, they suggested that the applicant study a design more in keeping with an enclosed porch using louvered screens.

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

17. 1355 Magazine St.

Application: Kyle Hamm, applicant; Anne Y Stoltze, Valence Properties LLC, owner; New construction of 2,703 SF single family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that the building details were not consistent with the style of the building. The proposed balcony and roof overhang need to be studied, the columns should be rectangular and the roof should break. The gabled portion of the mass should be enlarged. The material at the side elevations should remain the same, if you want the material to change, there should be a change in plane. The double hung windows should be drawn accurately. The weatherboards at the rear should extend the full height of the gable.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time, there being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.